A North American Workforce Development Agenda
Better Jobs for a More Competitive Region

E. Anthony Wayne
Career Ambassador (ret.)
Public Policy Fellow at the Wilson Center

wayneea@gmail.com

@EAnthonyWayne
CSG West
July 17 2019
North American Challenges

- The United States, Mexico and Canada face alarming skills gaps and mismatches: harm competitiveness and economic performance.

- Skills problems are likely to grow given the technological transformations and global competition ahead.

- North America’s integrated production and commercial networks mean regional collaboration on workforce development is vital.

- Governments, companies, schools and others should focus now on investment in continent’s workforces to prepare for the “future of work.”

- Mexico, Canada and the United States’ national programs are not sufficient and do not encourage North American collaboration.

- USMCA will open opportunities for tri-lateral collaboration.
Employers Are Having Difficulty Filling Jobs

According to Manpower’s 2018 talent shortage survey, 50% of Mexican employers, 46% of U.S. employers and 41% of Canadian employers have had difficulty filling open positions: skills mismatches as a key problem.

Source: Manpower Group, 2018 Talent Shortage Survey
World Economic Forum’s 2018 Future of Jobs Report

Surveyed over 300 global companies from 20 economies - representing 70% of global GDP and 15 million employees:

1. Across all jobs there will be a 42% change in workforce skills from 2018-2022.
2. Over 54% of workers will require reskilling or upskilling.
3. 50% of companies expect to reduce full-time workers. But, almost 40% expect to expand their workforce.
4. Geographic location for production likely determined by availability of skilled local talent say 74% of companies surveyed. 64% highlight labor costs.
5. Strategies to address skills gap vary widely: hiring new staff with required skills; automate work tasks; retrain workers; use contractors.
6. Staff most at risk of being displaced are less likely to be offered training.

WEF Global Findings: Division of Labor as Share of Work Hours (%)
Future of Jobs Report – WEF 2018

Who is ready for the coming wave of automation?

### The Automation Readiness Index

1. South Korea: 91.3
2. Germany: 89.6
3. Singapore: 87.3
4. Japan: 82.6
5. Canada: 81.8
6. Estonia: 79.5
7. France: 78.9
8. UK: 73.1
9. US: 72.0
10. Australia: 70.4
17. Argentina: 51.7
19. Brazil: 46.4
20. Colombia: 44.7
23. Mexico: 40.7
24. Vietnam: 37.3

Source: The Economist, 2019
WEF: A Virtuous Cycle of Technology and Upskilling

Skills gaps can hamper the incorporation of new technology and business growth.

Human capital investment can maximize use of new technology & business growth.

Reskilling & upskilling should be in business models: "augmentation strategy."

Governments should foster and support such trends with policies, programs and investments.

## WEF: Factors determining job location in North America

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industry</th>
<th>Primary</th>
<th>Secondary</th>
<th>Tertiary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Automotive, Aerospace, Supply Chain &amp; Transport</td>
<td>Talent availability</td>
<td>Quality of the supply chain</td>
<td>Labour cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aviation, Travel &amp; Tourism</td>
<td>Talent availability</td>
<td>Organization HQ</td>
<td>Ease of importing talent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemistry, Advanced Materials &amp; Biotechnology</td>
<td>Talent availability</td>
<td>Labour cost</td>
<td>Production cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumer</td>
<td>Talent availability</td>
<td>Labour cost</td>
<td>Quality of the supply chain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy Utilities &amp; Technologies</td>
<td>Labour cost</td>
<td>Production cost</td>
<td>Talent availability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Services &amp; Investors</td>
<td>Talent availability</td>
<td>Organization HQ</td>
<td>Geographic concentration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Health &amp; Healthcare</td>
<td>Talent availability</td>
<td>Labour cost</td>
<td>Production cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information &amp; Communication Technologies</td>
<td>Talent availability</td>
<td>Labour cost</td>
<td>Geographic concentration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>Talent availability</td>
<td>Labour cost</td>
<td>Geographic concentration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oil &amp; Gas</td>
<td>Talent availability</td>
<td>Production cost</td>
<td>Labour cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Services</td>
<td>Talent availability</td>
<td>Labour cost</td>
<td>Strong local ed. provision</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Range of options: Flexibility of labour laws, Geographic spread, Quality of the supply chain, Ease of importing talent, Labour cost, Location of raw materials, Organization HQ, Production cost, Strong local education provision, Talent availability.

WEF North America: Average reskilling needs (share of workforce)

Towards a U.S. Reskilling Revolution

- The U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics predicts that 1.37 million U.S. workers will be displaced from their roles in the next decade.

- The reskilling cost is estimated to be $34 billion dollars.

On average, the costs of reskilling would be $24,800 per displaced worker.

Source: Future of Work Project 2019, World Economic Forum
Reskilling on a North American Scale

- McKinsey Global Institute argues that by 2030, 375 million workers globally will need to change occupations or undergo reskilling.

Workforce Development: North American Cooperation

- North American dialogue can help create jobs, and boost competitiveness.

- Wilson Center proposal: a *tri-lateral task force provides an umbrella for public-private, federal-sub-federal working groups to identify best practices and develop proposals for cooperation across the three countries.* Four Working groups:
  
  - 1) **Apprenticeships** & other *work-based learning* and technical education;
  - 2) **Certifications** and related issues;
  - 3) **Data** collection and transparency;
  - 4) **Best practices** to manage for the *Fourth Industrial Revolution.*
Implementing the North American Agenda

• The overarching tri-national task force and the four working groups could be incorporated into or synced with the USMCA.

• The successful implementation will depend on collaboration of governments, private sector, educational institutions, and unions, among other stakeholders, from all three countries.

• Dangers of inaction includes social and political disruption.

• Workforce Development will help strengthen competitiveness and managing tumult of technological change.
Mexico Workforce Development Proposals: AMLO’s Program: “Youth Building the Future”

• Objectives:
  – Increase job/training opportunities for **2.6 million young Mexicans** aged 18-29 that are not studying or in employment.
  – Reduce youth involvement in **criminal activity**, and **increase productivity** levels and **economic growth**.

• Two Parts:
  – 2.3 million **scholarships for work** training in the private, not-for-profit and public sectors.
  – 300,000 annual **scholarships for college**.

• **1-year mentorship programs** aimed at training young people with relevant work skills
  – Programs created individually by companies, NGOs or the Labor Ministry; at least **one tutor** per firm.
  – 70% of programs in private sector, 20% in public sector, 10% in civil society sector.

• Critics:
  – Insufficient skill based curriculum or measuring of results.
  – Need major upgrades of Mexico’s education system at all levels.

Source: OCDE, 2018; “Jóvenes Construyendo futuro” Website, 2018.
US Workforce Development Proposals

- **July 2017 executive order: Expanding Apprenticeships in America**
  - Provide more affordable pathways to good paying jobs by promoting apprenticeships.
  - **June 2019** Labor Dept. proposed industry-recognized apprenticeship programs, plus $183 million in grants to support them.

- **July 2018 executive order: Creates of the President’s National Council for the American Worker**
  - Objective: produce a **national strategy** to assure workers and students are job ready for today’s economy and develop recommendations on policy and strategy related to **workforce development**.
  - Council met for in March 2019. Established **four working groups** on 1) promoting multiple pathways to careers; 2) increasing data transparency; 3) modernizing candidate recruitment; and 4) encouraging employer-led training. **Recommendations expected in September 2019.**

- **Pledge to America’s Workers:**
  - Facilitate creation of at least **6 million training opportunities for American students and workers.**
  - **200 companies and associations pledged** to create new opportunities over **five years**, including apprenticeships & work-based learning, continuing education, on-the-job training, and reskilling. **How will results be measured?**

Source: The White House, 2018; The Department of Commerce, 2019.
Canada Workforce Development Proposals

• Established Workforce Development Agreements (WDA’s) with provincial and territorial governments.
  – The agreements provide $722 million annually, as well as an additional $900 million from 2017-18 to 2022-23, for the development of programs to help Canadians get training and develop their skills.

• In May 2018 the Minister of Employment & Workforce Development requested proposals for a new Future Skills Center and applications for a Future Skills Council. Objectives:
  – Explore innovative approaches to skills development.
  – Identify the skills employers will need now and in the future.
  – Share information and best practices to inform future investments and programming.
  – Invest $225 million over 4 years and $75 million per year thereafter.

• Government investing $11 million in the 2018 Flexibility and Innovation in Apprenticeship Technical Training pilot program
  – Will fund third-party organizations to test approaches on how to improve access to apprenticeships.
  – Currently, there are over 400 apprenticeship programs available across Canada.
United States: Specific Challenges – skilled workers

4.6M manufacturing jobs to fill from 2018 - 2028

Only 2.2M jobs are likely to be filled

2.4M (53 out of 100) open positions lie vacant due to a skills shortage in the US manufacturing industry

The skills gaps and mismatches could leave 2.4 million positions unfilled, says Deloitte

Source: 2018 Deloitte and the Manufacturing Institute Skills Gap and Future of Work Study
Shortages of skilled people will harm U.S. Manufacturing

Skills shortage could put US$454 billion of manufacturing GDP at risk in 2028 alone

Source: 2018 Deloitte and the Manufacturing Institute Skills Gap and Future of Work Study
Job openings in manufacturing industry growing at double-digit rates since 2017

47% of today’s jobs might be gone in the next 10 years.
- Including 20% of assembler jobs in manufacturing.

Overall headcount, however, is expected to increase: these jobs would transition into other skills, likely infused with technology.

89% of executives see skills/talent shortages in U.S. manufacturing (5% more than in 2015).

15% increase in the number of companies offering higher pay to skilled workers vice 2015.

Companies expect the number of job categories with “very high” shortages to triple by 2021.

Source: Deloitte and the Manufacturing Institute Skills Gap and Future of Work Study, 2018
Digitally skilled U.S. workers:
Higher skilled workforce using digital technology = higher wages

Digitalized places are pulling away from less digitally skilled places.

Source: Brookings analysis of O’NET, OES and Moody’s
Average automation potential by county, 2016

- Jobs in “heartland” states & counties, specialized in manufacturing with low-skilled workers, will be hard-hit by automation and Artificial Intelligence (AI).

- The more educated and skilled counties along the Boston-Washington Corridor and on the West Coast appear less exposed to job losses because of AI automation.

- Larger and better educated cities will experience less disruption; less educated and smaller communities will encounter greater difficulties.

Source: Brookings analysis of BLS, Census, EMSI, Moodys, and McKinsey data
Occupations at Risk Across OECD countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupations</th>
<th>Risk of automation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Keyboard operators</td>
<td>91.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Street vendors (excluding food)</td>
<td>89.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Metal processing and finishing plant operators</td>
<td>87.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Subsistence livestock farmers</td>
<td>87.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Rubber, plastic and paper products machine operators</td>
<td>86.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Chemical and photographic products plan machine operators</td>
<td>85.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Blacksmiths, toolmakers and related trades workers</td>
<td>84.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Wood processing and papermaking plant operators</td>
<td>80.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Mining and mineral processing plant operators</td>
<td>72.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Mining and construction workers</td>
<td>80.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Medical and pharmaceutical technicians</td>
<td>78.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The OECD estimates that 10.2% of jobs in the U.S. and 8.5% of Canadian jobs have a high risk of automation, and that these workers need training to avoid this risk.

Mexico ranks in the bottom 20% on most measures of skills development. Has recommended major education system upgrades to prepare for job skills.

Insufficient Workforce Development Budgets

Economist Intelligence Unit study shows a ranking of who is ready for the coming wave of automation, the U.S. ranked 9, Canada ranked 5, and Mexico ranked 23 out of 25 countries.

The North American countries are behind in terms of investment in workforce development.

Note: * Only 2015 data available.
Source: OECD Stat, 2019
WEF Recommendations:
Strategies for building a skilled-based market

- **Learning ecosystem strategies**
  1. Build, adapt and certify foundational skills
  2. Build, adapt and certify advanced skills
  3. Build, adapt and certify skills among the adult workforce
  4. Realize the potential of educational technology training and personalized learning

- **Workforce ecosystem strategies**
  5. Map the skills content of jobs
  6. Design coherent and portable certifications
  7. Rethink organization and talent management processes

- **Enabling environment strategies**
  8. Drive momentum around the concept of skills
  9. Align skills taxonomies
  10. Shape culture, mindsets and mechanisms for lifelong learning

Accenture: Employment Gains and Revenue Gains

Companies that succeed in the **integration of technology and human capital** could **increase profits by 38% and employment by 10%** by 2022.

Recommendations

National and State/Provincial governments should act now to help reorient workforces to in-demand skills:

1. Create **multi-actor forums** to identify, share and build on **best practices**.

2. Incentivize areas to **align education, workforce training and economic development systems with the employers’ needs**; recognize importance of higher-order **soft skills** as well as technical.

3. Look for ways to **help accelerate the adoption of intelligent technology** in economies and firms more likely to be left behind. Encourage evolution from front-loaded education to **ongoing learning**.

4. Federal and state policymakers, governments, private sector and academia coordinate to **channel job-creating investment to help places with the most negative impacts of automation**.
   - Could focus on areas as regional “growth poles” serving as anchors to enhance high-value employment growth in the larger region.
   - Policy tools: research, tax, infrastructure and economic development benefits including targeted hiring credits, job subsidies or job guarantees.

Source: Brookings “Countering the geographical impacts of automation: Computers, AI and place disparities”, 2019
A North American Workforce Development Agenda
Better Jobs for a More Competitive Region

Full study available at: https://www.wilsoncenter.org/publication/north-american-workforce-development-agenda

E. Anthony Wayne
Career Ambassador (ret.)
Public Policy Fellow at the Wilson Center
wayneea@gmail.com
www.eawayne.com
WILSON CENTER
RECOMMENDATIONS:
Four North American Working Groups
Under a Public-Private Task Force
Working Group #1: Apprenticeships and other types of work-based learning and technical education

1. Agree trilaterally on a definition of apprenticeships, and a minimum set of criteria and quality standards.

2. Agree on broad guidelines on assigning responsibilities to governments, industry and intermediaries regarding the development, implementation and funding of apprenticeships.

3. Agree on building a tri-national Career and Technical Education and apprenticeships taskforce to identify best practices to promote apprenticeships and other types of work-based learning programs.
Working Group #1: Apprenticeships and other types of work-based learning and technical education

4. Agree on core elements of a **marketing strategy to increase public awareness** of the benefits and advantages of work-based learning.

5. Agree on building **tri-national spaces to foster on-going dialogue between stakeholders across the region** to share best practices on work-based learning and to strengthen public-private partnerships.

6. Agree among the three countries on promising means to **incentivize and support companies, including SMEs**, to develop training and learning programs for reskilling and “upskilling” their workforces.
1. Agree at federal and sub-national levels on a common terminology about credentials and competencies to facilitate broader understanding, transferability and recognition of credentials.

2. Agree on developing or strengthening national competency frameworks and aligning them to the tri-national common terminology for credentials and competencies.

3. Agree tri-nationally on a set of guidelines to assess and validate informal learning and professional experience, and to identify skills associated with such experience.
1. Agree on a tri-national set of norms to collect real time labor market data and information in a consistent and homogeneous way, so it is understandable and comparable across the region.

2. Agree on the development of a tri-national online platform (linked to national platforms) that can serve as a hub of the real-time labor market data collected by the three countries. It can also serve as a hub of best practices from across the region.

3. Agree on guidelines to make the tri-national platform and data tools openly available to all stakeholders, while allowing space for the development of private sector initiatives.
Working Group #4: Best Practices to prepare for the “Fourth Industrial Revolution”

1. Agree on key steps and tools to incentivize companies to invest in reskilling and “upskilling” of their workers, to provide mid-career training and learning opportunities, and to develop short-term, agile training and learning programs to ease the transitions needed with the technological changes expected with the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

2. Agree on building tri-national spaces to share best practices on the implementation of “Industry 4.0”, including on the roles of governments, the private sector, educational institutions and workers.

3. Agree tri-nationally on best practices to support SMEs in keeping up with technological changes, innovation and talent creation.
Working Group #4: Best Practices to Approach/Prepare for the Fourth Industrial Revolution

4. Agree tri-nationally on approaches and strategies to encourage companies to collaborate with educational institutions, unions and other interested parties in order to
   – better align curricula with the labor market needs,
   – better connect students to the labor market and workers with up-skilling and re-training programs,
   – and foster the ongoing modernization of academic spaces.

5. Establish trilateral research and innovation projects in strategic economic areas through grants and scholarships.
APPENDIX
### WEF Global Findings: Emerging and Declining Jobs in 2022
#### 2018 Future of Jobs Report

**Top 10 Emerging** | **Top 10 Declining**
---|---
Data Analyst & Scientists | Data Entry Clerks
AI and Machine Learning Specialists | Accounting, Bookkeeping & Payroll Clerks
General & Operations Managers | Administrative & Executive Secretaries
Software & Applications Developers & Analysts | Assembly & Factory Workers
Sales and Marketing Professionals | Client Information & Customer Service Workers
Big Data Specialists | Business Services & Administration Managers
Digital Transformation Specialists | Accountants & Auditors
New Technology Specialists | Material-Recording & Stock-Keeping Clerks
Organizational Development Specialists | General & Operations Managers
Information Technology Services | Postal Service Clerks

### WEF Global Findings: Adoption of Robots 2022
### 2018 Future of Jobs Report

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Adoption among companies by 2022</th>
<th>First movers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Humanoid Robots</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>(35%) Financial Services and Investors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stationary Robots</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>(53%) Automotive, Aerospace, Supply Chain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aerial and Underwater Robots</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>(52%) Oil and Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-humanoid Land Robots</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>(42%) Automotive, Aerospace, Supply Chain</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

WEF Recommendations for Governments
2018 Future of Jobs Report

- Upgrade educational policies to raise education and skills levels of people of all ages:
  - Adapt/update school curricula
  - Train teachers
  - Offer vocational training
  - Develop better social safety net programs to support reskilling/transition

- Complement educational and skills development with job creation through public investments.

- Use increased tax revenues from technology-enhanced productivity to fund social safety nets programs for at-risk workers.

WEF Recommendations for Businesses
2018 Future of Jobs Report

• Need for a comprehensive augmentation strategy in which businesses use automation to complement the human workforce and enable workers to better use their full potential.

• Develop lifelong learning systems in companies and in societies.

• Invest in human capital and establish marketable credentials; would increase labor market flexibility & reduce hiring time and costs.

• Businesses, Governments, Educational institutions and workers/unions need to collaborate on workforce strategy.

2018 WEF FINDINGS: NORTH AMERICA
Expanding job roles

Software and Applications Developers and Analysts
Data Analysts and Scientists
Managing Directors and Chief Executives
General and Operations Managers
Sales and Marketing Professionals
Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing,
Technical and Scientific Products
Human Resources Specialists
Financial Analysts
Electrotechnology Engineers
Financial and Investment Advisers

Emerging Skills Needed

Analytical thinking and innovation
Creativity, originality and initiative
Active learning and learning strategies
Technology design and programming
Critical thinking and analysis
Complex problem-solving
Leadership and social influence
Reasoning, problem-solving and ideation
Emotional intelligence
Systems analysis and evaluation

## Technology adoption (share of companies surveyed)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Technology</th>
<th>Share of Companies Surveyed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>User and entity big data analytics</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet of things</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>App- and web-enabled markets</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Machine learning</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cloud computing</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Augmented and virtual reality</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital trade</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encryption</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New materials</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wearable electronics</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distributed ledger (blockchain)</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3D printing</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomous transport</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stationary robots</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantum computing</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-humanoid land robots</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humanoid robots</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biotechnology</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aerial and underwater robots</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Responses to shifting skill needs (*shared of companies surveyed*)

- Look to automate the work: 84% Likely, 11% Equally likely, 5% Unlikely
- Hire new permanent staff with skills relevant to new technologies: 83% Likely, 13% Equally likely, 4% Unlikely
- Retrain existing employees: 81% Likely, 15% Equally likely, 4% Unlikely
- Hire new temporary staff with skills relevant to new technologies: 66% Likely, 19% Equally likely, 15% Unlikely
- Expect existing employees to pick up skills on the job: 65% Likely, 20% Equally likely, 15% Unlikely
- Outsource some business functions to external contractors: 63% Likely, 27% Equally likely, 10% Unlikely
- Hire freelancers with skills relevant to new technologies: 59% Likely, 24% Equally likely, 17% Unlikely
- Strategic redundancies of staff who lack the skills to use new technologies: 46% Likely, 32% Equally likely, 22% Unlikely

Projected use of training providers (share of training)

- Internal department: 52%
- Private training providers: 27%
- Private educational institutions: 21%
- Public educational institutions: 17%
- Public training provider: 15%